WASE 2296

Saltpetre in Medicial Composido

Article by 6. Smith May 2009

Saltpetre in Medieval Gunpowder - Calcium or Potassium Nitrate?

By Geoff Smith

Until recently, it has been accepted that the formulation of gunpowder has always been based on variable mixtures of charcoal, sulphur and potassium nitrate. This has recently been challenged.

It has been asserted that early gunpowder was based on lime saltpetre that is calcium nitrate. This paper examines that claim.

The earliest documentary details of gunpowder manufacture known in western literature are contained in *Das Feuerwerkbuch* written in about 1400. The language is Middle High German and we are indebted to Prof. Gerhard Kramer for a modern translation¹. The introduction to the translation claims that the text " …refers exclusively to calcium nitrate" and that "… potassium nitrate was introduced into powder making towards the middle of the sixteenth century." It is further stated that… "This surprising inference can now be considered as well established." The translation was reported in proceedings of The International Committee for the History of Technology (ICOTECH) and the editor of the compiled papers commentated that this could require revision of our current understanding of early gunpowder². The idea has been repeated in more recent publications^{3 4} and appears to be taking root in the literature with authors quoting it as established fact.

The proposition that all early gunpowder was based on calcium nitrate represents such a significant shift in our understanding of the history of this important mixture that it should reasonably be expected to withstand rigorous testing before it is universally accepted. In particular, any theory should pass the test of Occam's Razor; that it should be supported by the available evidence and that no simpler explanation is available.

Historical context

First, it must be recognised that the terms saltpetre or nitre were loosely defined at the time and of little help. Chemicals in the 14/15th centuries could have different names in different localities and until about the 17th century, they can only be reliably identified by their associated characteristics of appearance, taste⁵, smell or how they react with other materials.⁶

Saltpetre was historically either collected from naturally occurring deposits in very limited geographic locations or, more usually, extracted from rotting organic material. Dung, urine and vegetable matter were stacked and allowed to ferment⁷. Ammonia in the mix was converted to nitrite by *Nitrosomas* and this was converted to nitrate by *Nitrobacter*. Both of these organisms require a neutral or slightly alkaline environment to operate, whereas the decaying matter is naturally acidic. Lime was added, as in agriculture, to reduce the acidity of the pile to a more suitable level. There was therefore a large amount

of calcium present in the mix. However calcium carbonate and sulphate are both essentially insoluble in water and it cannot be assumed that calcium ions were proportionately present in the subsequent leachate. Saltpetre was manufactured by this method until well after WW1 and was well-documented using modern terminology⁸. The liquor is rich in nitrate and contains variable proportions of sodium, calcium and potassium ions. Conventionally, the potassium salt is enhanced by the addition of excess potassium in the form of potash derived from wood ash. This operation is first described in western literature by Biringuccio in his *Pyrotechnica* dated at about 1538.

Since this post-dates *Das Feuerwerkbuch* (1432) which does not mention the procedure, the translators draw the conclusion that the chemical conversion did not take place and that only calcium nitrate was formed.

This view is open to challenge on a number of fronts.

The 13th Century Arabic text of Hassan al-Rammah gives a detailed description of the purification of saltpetre using wood ash.⁹ It should be remembered that trade with the east was well established at that time and a purely Eurocentric view ignores this. Saltpetre was imported from Arabic lands and western alchemists recognised that the art was most highly developed there, hence Al-chemie. *Das Feuerwerkbuch*, Folio 78, states that the salt was imported into Germany and specifically warns of the difficulty of obtaining a good quality product from (or via) Venice¹⁰.

Crystal chemistry

Even in the absence of additional potassium ions, the relative solubility of the salts present dictates that the first crop of crystals precipitated from a cooling concentrated solution will be potassium nitrate. The unwanted sodium and calcium salts remain in solution to be rejected or, in later developments of the technology, recycled¹¹. The yield would be low compared with the later potassium enhanced process and purity would be limited by a single crystallisation, but the product would nevertheless be largely potassium saltpetre¹². It is worth noting that instructions for purifying saltpetre universally specify fractional crystallisation rather than evaporation to dryness which would not separate the contaminants. In colonial India, saltpetre extraction was the duty of the *nuniah*. He was specifically forbidden from allowing the evaporation to go so far as to crystallise sodium chloride by the excise authorities since this was a different monopoly and subject to different taxation.¹³

Textual evidence

The fact that a published text does not mention a procedure is not proof that it was not understood and/or commonly used¹⁴. *Das Feuerwerkbuch* records a wide range of formulations and presumably acted as an aide memoir for gunners who could not be expected to recall accurately the proportions of all the mixtures listed¹⁵. However, medieval craftsmen were well known for guarding the secrets of their trade. It appears very credible that the one

crucial secret of successful gunpowder would only have been passed verbally at the end of an apprentice's training. Indeed, it is not uncommon today to register a patent with sufficient detail to protect a process without giving all of the details required for manufacturing success.

It is also worth considering the (unknown) copyist of the manuscript¹⁶. It is quite possible that the record was dictated to a scribe who did not understand (or was not told) the critical step in the saltpetre manufacturing process for the reason given above. Again, the problem is well known in current technology transfer projects. Nevertheless, this omitted statement of procedure appears to be the sole basis of the claim for the use of calcium nitrate.

Hygroscopic or deliquescent?

Early gunpowder was notoriously difficult to keep dry. This is usually attributed to the presence of sodium salts which are hygroscopic i.e. absorb atmospheric moisture, unlike potassium nitrate which does not. However, it is not accurate to describe calcium nitrate as hygroscopic (or even very hygroscopic) as reported in the Das Feuerwerkbuch and elsewhere. It is properly described as deliquescent. That is, in the presence of atmospheric moisture, it will continue to absorb it until it dissolves. Crystals of calcium nitrate stored in the open eventually transform into a pool of liquid - not a promising material for a battlefield explosive. The sensitivity to moisture of early gunpowder is sufficiently explained by a trace impurity of the calcium salt (and/or magnesium or sodium). It is not suggested that early saltpetre was pure potassium nitrate. Indeed, the literature records continuous effort to improve the purity of the product. Furthermore, storage conditions at that time were unlikely to be airtight and the problem of dampness in powder for naval use is self-evident. The floor of the Grand Magazine of HMS Victory has a layer of charcoal under the floor to absorb moisture from the bilges and the problem was still present as late as 1855 when Dundas gave details of the procedure for drying naval powder.¹⁷

The suggestion¹⁸ that the introduction of knurling reduced the absorption of water does not withstand examination. Calcium nitrate already contains water of crystallisation chemically bound to the molecule (vide infra). Further, in the absence of any compression of the gunpowder cake, the knurls would have been relatively porous and the effect on the dynamics of moisture absorption would be slight. The outstanding advantages of knurling are to reduce the considerable hazard of fine gunpowder dust, to prevent separation of the constituents during transport and to promote more uniform combustion by providing for the passage of the burning front through the charge¹⁹.

Chemical evidence

The most conclusive evidence, however, is contained in *Das Feuerwerkbuch* itself. Modern chemical analysis was not available to artisans of the period but that is not to say that they had no effective tools. Many chemical elements will impart a highly characteristic colour to a flame. Sodium produces characteristic yellow, calcium a brick red and potassium lilac. This was first

reported by Chinese alchemists as early as the 5th century²⁰ (possibly 3rd century) and is commonly reported in later western literature. *Das Feuerwerkbuch,* Folio 77 clearly states that a blue flame is characteristic of good saltpetre. This is repeated in Folio 78 ..."If the drops (*of purified nitrate*) burn well and brightly and give blue²¹ flames, the saltpetre is good". The saltpetre is thus clearly and unequivocally identified as being the potassium salt. The editors of the Firework Book recognise this in a footnote (p 11) but the author fails to acknowledge the force of this direct evidence in the commentary.

It is worth noting that the characteristic lilac potassium flame colour is readily masked by even small amounts of sodium or calcium. Not only is the potassium salt identified but also it is evidently substantially pure.

Experimental evidence

The ultimate test of any hypothesis is experiment. Current UK legislation makes experimentation in this field difficult. However, the Danish Medieval Gunpowder Research Group has manufactured calcium gunpowder and report that the mixture "was difficult to ignite".²² There is sound reason for expecting this result. Calcium nitrate crystallises with four molecules of water of crystallisation. When heated, these are driven off to give the anhydrous salt. The energy required for this reaction has to be satisfied before the oxygen content of the nitrate group can be made available for combustion; hence the reported difficulty of igniting such a mixture.²³

Conclusion

The theory that early gunpowder was based on calcium nitrate has been examined. It is based, not on positive evidence, but on the absence of a statement from a medieval document that could have had good reason to omit it.

However, the document does contain a statement (repeated twice) that clearly and irrefutably identifies the major constituent of saltpetre as potassium nitrate and this is supported by the known properties of the calcium salt.

Although the translation of *Das Fuerwerkbuch* remains a valuable contribution to the literature of early gunpowder, the associated notes and commentary must be treated with considerable caution.

From the available evidence, the theory that early gunpowder was exclusively based on calcium nitrate is untenable.

¹ Published as the Jubilee Number of the Journal of the Arms and Armour Society Vol XVII No 1 March 2001

² Buchanan, Brenda, J, ed. *Gunpowder – The History of an International Technique*, Bath Oniv Press 1996

³ Harding D F, *Smallarms of the East India Company 1600 – 1856*, Vol III, Foresight Books 1999, P 33 footnote a.

⁴ Jack Kelly, Gunpowder, A History of the Explosive that changed the world, Atlantic Books 2004, pp36, 62-63

⁵ "... the soil of such caves, cellars, stables, pens and manure-heaps... should be tested for saltpetre. If the salt exists in considerable quantities, it may be detected by the taste..." Joseph LeConte, Instructions for the manufacture of saltpetre, Charles P Pelham, State Printer, Columbia (SC) 1862 P 5. Author's note: This document records the then current French, Prussian, Swiss and Swedish methods of production and confirms the need for alkaline conditions (and a robust approach to chemical analysis!)

⁶ For example, the Biblical quotation "...For though thou wash thee with nitre, and take thee much soap..." (Jeremiah 2:22) is evidently referring to natron, a native form of potassium carbonate which would have similar properties to sodium carbonate - washing soda - not potassium nitrate which has no such cleaning properties.

Saltpetre farms are not recorded during the period under discussion but Buchanan has made a credible case that the conditions existed for unplanned local waste deposits to provide the same conditions giving rise to "natural" deposits. *Gunpowder* Ch 4.

Arthur Marshall, Explosives Vol 3 part 2, Churchill 1932 revision of 1917 ed ⁹ Al-furusiyya wa al-manasib al-harbiyya (The Book of Military Horsemanship and Ingenious War Devices) Partington , J.R. The History of Greek Fire and Gunpowder, Heffer, Cambridge 1960 p 201 Note A more recent annotated edition clarifies some of the linguistic issues. Hassan Aleppo, p130

¹⁰ The geography of Venice makes it an unlikely candidate for primary production but it was a major trade centre for the region. It is suggested that a major source could have been Petra with the ensuing possibility that the material was originally 'Sal Petra'. Objective evidence is being sought but the materials. Camel dung and water, were available in large quantities from the long established caravan routes. Alternatively the name could have been acquired en passant as Stilton cheese is named after the coaching stop. ¹¹ Ernst Jänecke, Uber die Bildung von Konversionssalpeter vom Standpunkt der

Phasionehre, Anorg Chem (Zeitisch) 1911pp1-18

¹² Modern practice recognises that the pure crystals are still moist with a solution of the contaminants and this is washed off with a small amount of pure water; loosing a small percentage of the pure product which may be recycled.

Marshall. Explosives.

¹⁴ For example; Pliney the Elder is generally credited with the first reference to the use of soap in the first century AD but the Ebers Papyrus, a medical document from about 1500 B.C., describes combining animal and vegetable oils with alkaline salts to form a soap-like material used for treating skin diseases, as well as for washing. Papyros Ebers. The first complete translation from the Egyptian, by H. Joachim. Berlin, G. Reimer, 1890.

¹⁵ The master must also be able to read and write because in no other way can he keep all the required knowledge in his mind... Folio 75

¹⁶ The translation of *Fuerwerkbuch* cited is based on Freiburg MS 362 which is believed to be the earliest copy available but it, and other versions, are not the original primary document. ¹⁷ Dundas, A treatise on Naval gunnery 1855, para. 447, Conway Maritime Press.

¹⁸ Fuerwerkbuch commentary p71

¹⁹ Modern, highly compressed, gunpowder is still recognised as being in equilibrium with atmospheric moisture. Exposure to 70% RH for 3 hrs (a standard test) results in a moisture content of 2.2% Cacket. J. C. Monograph on Pyrotechnic Compositions Fort Halstead 1965 p 115.

²⁰ Thao Hung-Ching, *Ming I Pieh Lu*, Quoted in Needham J et al, *Science and Civilisation in* China. Cambridge University Press Vol 5 Chemistry and chemical technology. part 7 Military Technology; The Gunpowder Epic. ²¹ The transliteration between blue and violet is not unreasonable considering the multilingual

translations between medieval German, Chinese and English but there can be no credible confusion with the brick red flame colouration of calcium salts.

Not formally published.

²³ Kramer notes this reaction (*Gunpowder pp. 51,52*) and states that when the calcium nitrate solution is boiled above 100°C the water of crystallisation is driven off. This is evidently mistaken. The water of crystallisation is only bound to the molecule when crystallisation takes place. In solution there are no crystals and hence no water of crystallisation.

On the Absence of Wood Ash from the Firework Book an Unreported Reaction

In 2000 The Arms and Armour Society sponsored a translation of *Das Feuerwerkbuch.* (FWB) This manuscript contains the earliest (Western) references to gunpowder. The editorial comment of the translation contained the unsubstantiated assertion that, since certain processes were not specifically mentioned in the text, they were not carried out and that consequently the nitrate of medieval gunpowder was calcium based.

This has been shown to be incorrect¹ but the concept seems to have taken root among some historians unable to understand the clear technical evidence in the manuscript.²

Although the processes described in the FWB were capable of delivering substantially pure potassium nitrate, there remains a possibility that some calcium (or magnesium) nitrate could remain as a minor impurity sufficient to affect the quality of the gunpowder.

This present paper gives evidence that such contamination was sometimes (but not always) present but was neutralised during the manufacturing process.

Since the publication of Biringuccio's Pyrotechnica in about 1538, it has been accepted that potash (potassium carbonate) has been commonly added to impure saltpetre to convert any calcium salts to potassium nitrate according to the simple exchange reaction:

 $K_2CO_3 + Ca(NO_3)_2 \rightarrow CaCO_3 + 2KNO_3$

This reaction takes place in solution and the calcium carbonate precipitates out.

The earliest known record of gunpowder in western literature is contained in Das Feuerwerkbuch³ which makes no specific reference to this procedure. A recent translation⁴ includes the editorial assertion that the saltpetre mentioned in the text is calcium nitrate rather than the commonly accepted potassium nitrate. This assertion has been critically examined and shown to be unfounded⁵. However, although it can be confidently shown that the saltpetre was substantially pure potassium nitrate; there remains the possibility of some calcium salt being present as an undesirable impurity.

Medieval manuscripts frequently contain statements that are difficult to interpret in terms of modern chemistry and *Das* Feuerwerkbuch is no exception. Many of the formulations recorded contain materials of no obvious utility or infer reactions ranging from obscure to incomprehensible. Critical examination of the evidence, however, can sometimes produce a rational explanation for what, at first sight, appears to be medieval hyperbole.

The (translated) *Firework Book* contains an interesting statement.⁶

"....When you grind the components down to powder, they will mix very closely and become a little moist. Do not let this trouble you"...⁷

The potash used in later production was traditionally produced by the combustion of wood to ash⁸.

If the decomposition of wood is only partial the result is charcoal which, importantly, still contains the potash⁹. This is obscured in the literature by the common practice of referring to the charcoal in the gunpowder as C (i.e. elemental carbon).

Calcium nitrate crystallises from solution with four molecules of 'water of crystallisation' attached. When ground together with charcoal, we have the following possible reaction (The carbon content of the charcoal takes no part).

 $K_2CO_3 + Ca(NO_3)_2.4H_2O \longrightarrow CaCO_3 + 2KNO_3 + 4H_2O$

The water of crystallisation is now released from the calcium nitrate and the mixture '...becomes a little moist.' As it is no longer bound '...Do not let this trouble you' – because it is now free to evaporate.

As this reaction takes place initially in the solid state¹⁰, it will not initiate until '…you grind the components down to powder.'

The first water released will tend to facilitate the reaction in the solution phase by locally dissolving the active constituents.

The calcium carbonate produced is inert and remains in the gunpowder until eventual combustion releases it in the smoke.

The potassium content of wood ash varies with species, growing conditions and the temperature of production. Published figures¹¹ contain an interesting fact in that the nearest wood reviewed known to be suitable for gunpowder manufacture Aspen (Populus Tremulula) has a significantly higher potassium content compared with known unsuitable woods such as oak.

Charcoal burns leaving about 3-5% ash of which about 10% is available potassium¹². (up to 15% is reported) Unfortunately the most popular woods for gunpowder charcoal Alder, *Alnus Glucinosa*, Dogwood *Rhamnus Frangula* or Willow *Salix alba* are not specifically reported.

The Firework Book (p 35) gives the composition of 'ordinary powder' as 4 parts saltpetre, 2 parts sulphur and 1 part charcoal (by weight).

Thus, it can be shown that if roughly 0.3% of the saltpetre were calcium impurity, it would be completely converted to the potassium salt. See annex A.

For both safety and efficiency, later manufacturing methods routinely moistened the mixture during the grinding process¹³. This would have effectively masked the visual evidence for this reaction and, probably for this reason, it does not appear to have been previously reported in the literature.

Conclusion

A previous paper has shown that the saltpetre mentioned in *The Firework Book* was substantially pure potassium nitrate. Further, study of that work reveals evidence that modest amounts of calcium salt remaining as an impurity would have been converted to the potassium salt during the manufacturing process.

Although wood ash may not have been deliberately added, it is always present as a constituent of charcoal.

Incidentally, *The Firework Book* ¹⁴ refers to the use of charred cloth for high quality powder (a natural extension of the use of this material for tinder). Is this the first record of cylinder charcoal?

G Smith May 2009

The author welcomes discussion on gunpowder chemistry: smithgcp@aol.com

Annex A

Calculation

Molecular weights

K_2	Ca(NO ₃) ₂ .4H ₂ O	
78	236	a ratio of 1:3

Thus 1g of potassium converts about 3 g of calcium nitrate

Charcoal contains about 4% ash of which about 10% is available potassium

Thus the charcoal contains about 0.4% potassium

'Ordinary Gunpowder' contains 4 units of saltpetre to 1 of charcoal

1 g of charcoal contains 0.004g potassium which can convert roughly 0.012g of calcium nitrate i.e 0.3% of the total nitre.

However, the above figure for potassium content refers to modern charcoal manufactured by pyrolysis of wood in a closed retort (cylinder charcoal). Classical charcoal was made by partial combustion of a covered mound of wood. In this method, part of the wood burns to provide heat to the rest of the

pile. The wood which burns partially or completely leaves ash which is much higher in potassium content compared with the 'pure' charcoal. Some of this would inevitably be mixed with the charcoal. The calculated conversion can therefore safely be considered a worst case and 0.5% may be considered a reasonable estimate.

Note: 0 5% of a deliquescent impurity would be quite sufficient to produce nitre highly sensitive to atmospheric moisture.

⁷ For clarity, verbatim quotations from *The Firework Book* are italicised.

⁹ Charcoal also contains a number of other compounds, particularly volatile organic species that are critical to the early stages of ignition but are outside the scope of the present paper.

¹⁴ Das Fuerwerkbuche pp 35 & 43 …"Charcoal which has been made from a worn table cloth in a hot oven or on a fire in a closed container."

¹ Smith G Arms and Armour Society Vol XIX No 3 March 2008

³ Written in about 1400

⁴ Translated as *The Firework Book,* Kramer G W et al Arms And Armour Society Jubilee Number Vol XVII No.1 March 2001

⁵ Smith G Arms and Armour Society Vol XIX No 3 March 2008

⁶₋Folio 81

⁸ This was a major export from the forests of Canada and the primary source of potassium salts until the exploitation of the Strassfurt deposits of Carnallite (potassium magnesium chloride) in the second half of the 19C

¹⁰ Although the reaction is believed to initiate in the solid state, this is not beyond question. However sufficient water is always present to initiate the reaction deriving from both the deliquescence of any calcium nitrate and atmospheric moisture absorbed by the charcoal. Note; Modern gunpowder commonly contains about 2% moisture depending on atmospheric conditions.

¹¹ MAHENDRA K. MISRA, KENNETH W. RAGLAND and ANDREW J. BAKER Wood ash composition as a function of Furnace Temperature, Biomass and Bioenergy *Vol.* 4, No. 2, pp. 103-116, 1993

¹² Ref. ix

¹³ The continuous improvement in methods of purifying the saltpetre would have also minimised the reaction.